Case Study #2: Confucians, Daoists & the Costa Concordia’s Captain Schettino

Read the attached articles from USA and the International Business Times detailing the sinking of the ship, Costa Concordia then answer the following questions. Answers should be 1 paragraph long (approximately one third to one half page) and each supporting quote should be no longer than one or two short sentence and unique – you may not use the same quote twice. In citing the quote, all you need do is indicate the page from the text. All quotes should come from original source material (The Lun yu or Daodejing quoted in the text or the Sourcebook), and not secondary commentary. The completed assignment should be two pages long, using 12 pt. fonts and single spacing. This exercise is worth a total of 60 points. This is due on April 18th. Please refer to the further instructions and rubrics provided with the first Case Study assignment.

1. For Confucians, what would constitute a meaningful life? What role does duty, rules and regulations play in securing that life? Briefly explain your answer. (15 pts)  
   1b. Cite a supporting quote from the text to support your answer above. (2pts.)

2. For Daoists, what would constitute a meaningful life? What role does duty, rules and regulations play in securing that life? Briefly explain your answer. (15 pts)  
   2b. Cite a supporting quote from the text to support your answer above. (2pts.)

3. What do you think Kong Zhongni (Confucius) would have advised Schettino to have done after beaching the Concordia? Briefly explain your answer. (10 pts)  
   3b. Cite a supporting quote from the text to support your answer above. (2pts.)

4. What do you think Laozi or Zhuangzi would have advised Schettino to have done after beaching the Concordia? Briefly explain your answer. (10 pts)  
   4b. Cite a supporting quote from the text to support your answer above. (2pts.)

5. Which approach, that of Confucius or the Daoists, do you prefer? Briefly explain your answer. (2pts.)
Why the cruise ship Costa Concordia capsized remains a mystery to world maritime and salvage experts two weeks after the tragedy that left 16 people dead and 16 still missing.

The state-of-the-art ship carrying 4,200 passengers and crewmembers struck rocks off Italy's Tuscan island of Giglio on Jan. 13, opening a 160-foot hole in its side. Experts on ships and salvage have questions about how that tear turned into the worst cruise ship disaster of recent times. Chief among them:

• Why did the ship partially sink? Modern cruise ships are designed to remain afloat even after two of their water-tight compartments are breached, says Richard Pellew, who inspects cruise ships for the United Kingdom's Maritime and Coastguard Agency. If the gash exposed three compartments or if the crew didn't properly seal them, he and others say, flooding could have spread and capsized the vessel.

  "Any vessel that has such a collision could lose the game if response actions by the crew failed or were unorganized," says Anthony Davis, a retired U.S. Coast Guard officer.

• Why did the ship roll on its right, or starboard side, when the gash in the vessel was on the left, or port, side? In addition to a possible failure of the water-tight compartments, wind, currents and maneuvering of the ship could tilt the wounded vessel away from the

1 http://travel.usatoday.com/cruises/story/2012-01-26/Question-loom-over-Costa-Concordia-disaster/52808568/1
damage, says Dracos Vassalos, professor of maritime safety at Britain's University of Strathclyde.  
"The internal architecture of cruise ships is so complex that even with the same effects being accounted for in … experiments, computer simulations or, indeed, in real-life accidents, we could potentially see a different outcome every time we simulate the accident," Vassalos says.

Why did the captain, Francesco Schettino, run the ship aground after it was breached? Maritime experts say that's a captain's judgment call, based on how fast water is coming aboard. Even so, the grounding raises the question of whether the Costa Concordia was that gravely imperiled or could have waited for a tow to port.  
"That's not an unusual maneuver," T. Black Powell, president of JMS Naval Architects & Salvage Engineers in Mystic, Conn., says of grounding. "Typically, you're not going to do that, though, unless you've determined that the ship is lost and it's going to sink."

The ship's severe tilt after being run aground complicated the evacuation because lifeboats couldn't be lowered from one side of the ship.  
"The ship listed and was inclined to a degree that didn't enable us to use boats at the side of the ship," Pier Luigi Foschi, chief executive of Costa Cruises, said Jan. 16. "The fact that the ship was listing created a very difficult situation."

The answers to these crucial questions about the Costa Concordia disaster may not be known until information from the ship's "black box" of voyage data is released by Italian prosecutors, maritime experts say.

For example, if the black box recorded orders to close water-tight compartments, that could signal that the compartments hadn't been closed beforehand as they should be for shallow-water navigation.

Maritime experts say it's unclear when information from the black box will be released because Italian prosecutors are pursuing criminal charges against Schettino. The criminal case must be resolved before any accident investigation begins.

There has been conflicting information about Schettino's actions. However, he told prosecutors Jan. 17 that after striking the rocks he continued maneuvering the ship, before grounding the ship on a submerged reef.  
The ultimate findings are likely to spur greater safety precautions, which some experts say are needed.

"Considering the number of individuals that are being carried, certainly this should be a shot across the bow that things need to change," says Jim Hall, former chairman of the National Transportation Safety Board, which investigates maritime disasters in the USA.
Here is a translation of the transcript of the conversation between Capt. Francesco Schettino, commander of the grounded Costa Concordia, and Capt. Gregorio De Falco of the Italian coast guard in Livorno.

In the conversation, De Falco repeatedly orders Schettino to return to the ship to oversee the evacuation, while Schettino resists, making excuses that it's dark and that the ship is listing.

- STORY: How could a cruise go so wrong?

The audio was first made available on the website of Corriere della Sera, and the Italian coast guard confirmed its authenticity Tuesday to The Associated Press.

De Falco: "This is De Falco speaking from Livorno. Am I speaking with the commander?"
Schettino: "Yes. Good evening, Cmdr. De Falco."
De Falco: "Please tell me your name."
Schettino: "I'm Cmdr. Schettino, commander."
De Falco: "Schettino? Listen Schettino. There are people trapped on board. Now you go with your boat under the prow on the starboard side. There is a pilot ladder. You will climb that ladder and go on board. You go on board and then you will tell me how many people there are. Is that clear? I'm recording this conversation, Cmdr. Schettino…"
Schettino: "Commander, let me tell you one thing…"
De Falco: "Speak up! Put your hand in front of the microphone and speak more loudly, is that clear?"
Schettino: "In this moment, the boat is tipping…"
De Falco: "I understand that, listen, there are people that are coming down the pilot ladder of the prow. You go up that pilot ladder, get on that ship and tell me how many people are still on board. And what they need. Is that clear? You need to tell me if there are children, women or people in need of assistance. And tell me the exact number of each of these categories. Is that clear? Listen Schettino, that you saved yourself from the sea, but I am going to… I'm going to make sure you get in trouble. …I am going to make you pay for this. Go on board, (expletive)!"
Schettino: "Commander, please…"
De Falco: "No, please. You now get up and go on board. They are telling me that on board there are still…"
Schettino: "I am here with the rescue boats, I am here, I am not going anywhere, I am here…"
De Falco: "What are you doing, commander?"
Schettino: "I am here to coordinate the rescue…"
De Falco: "What are you coordinating there? Go on board! Coordinate the rescue from aboard the ship. Are you refusing?"
Schettino: "No, I am not refusing."
De Falco: "Are you refusing to go aboard commander? Can you tell me the reason why you are not going?"
Schettino: "I am not going because the other lifeboat is stopped."
De Falco: "You go aboard. It is an order. Don't make any more excuses. You have declared 'abandon ship.' Now I am in charge. You go on board! Is that clear? Do you hear me? Go, and call me when you are aboard. My air rescue crew is there."
Schettino: "Where are your rescuers?"
De Falco: "My air rescue is on the prow. Go. There are already bodies, Schettino."
Schettino: "How many bodies are there?"
De Falco: "I don't know. I have heard of one. You are the one who has to tell me how many there are. Christ."
Schettino: "But do you realize it is dark and here we can't see anything…"
De Falco: "And so what? You want to go home, Schettino? It is dark and you want to go home? Get on that prow of the boat using the pilot ladder and tell me what can be done, how many people there are and what their needs are. Now!"
Schettino: "…I am with my second in command."
De Falco: "So both of you go up then … You and your second go on board now. Is that clear?"
Schettino: "Commander, I want to go on board, but it is simply that the other boat here … there are other rescuers. It has stopped and is waiting…"
De Falco: "It has been an hour that you have been telling me the same thing. Now, go on board. Go on board! And then tell me immediately how many people there are there."
Schettino: "OK, commander"
De Falco: "Go, immediately!"

Audio in Italian is available at www.corriere.it

---

**INTERNATIONAL BUSINESS TIMES**

Costa Concordia Captain: What Francesco Schettino Should have Done³


January 18, 2012 5:53 PM EST

Francesco Schettino, the captain of the Costa Concordia cruise ship that sank in Italian waters on Friday, is currently facing criminal charges for manslaughter and abandoning ship. The seasoned sailor has become an international villain for his response to the accident, which has resulted in at least 11 deaths.

Although Costa and its parent company Carnival are now trying to distance themselves from the captain, Schettino had risen through the ranks to the point where he was trusted with a $500 million boat and the lives of more than 4,000 people.
"He's been at sea his whole career," Anthony Palmiotti, the chairman of the Marine Transportation Department at SUNY Maritime College in the Bronx, N.Y., told IBTimes.

"But that doesn't mean you're prepared for that kind of disaster. He's had a lot of experience in operations that weren't a crisis. But he is trained for a crisis."

**What Went Wrong**

All the training that Schettino received was apparently forgotten when he brought the Concordia five miles off course in order to give a salute "for Commodore Mario Palombo, with whom I was on the telephone," and then collided with a rock near the shores of Giglio Island in Italy.

As the ship began to list from 60 to 70 and finally to 80 degrees, it is believed that Schettino left the vessel and fled to shore, where he hailed a cab and drove inland.

The captain told judges in the town of Grosseto on Tuesday that while on board, he "was trying to get people to get into the boats in an orderly fashion" when he tripped and fell into a lifeboat and got stuck for an hour. Only later did he get in the water and head for land.

Even if this were true, it is still a serious breach in protocol; during an evacuation, the captain shouldn't be anywhere close to the lifeboats.

"The master must always be on the bridge and in command," Palmiotti explained.

"That was his [Schettino's] job -- to provide that command and control. He's supposed to have the big picture," so that he can direct the rest of his crew.

Every single registered ship has an emergency plan in place. The plan has to be approved by state authorities and regularly practiced.

On a ship the size of the Concordia, which is said to have had somewhere around 1,000 staff on board, about 200 to 300 crew members are assigned specific duties. Each has what is called a "muster station," which vary from helping passengers into rafts, taking attendance and giving out life jackets, and in the captain's case, piloting the entire procedure.

"There are steps a captain takes," Palmiotti said. "First you must assess what's going on. 'What steps can I take to mitigate what's happening?' And then you have to stop the problem -- fire, water... maybe you can maybe you can't."

"But you have to be there to do this," he added.
Chaos at Sea

Almost every aspect of the wreck of the Concordia was extraordinary. Because the boat was so top-heavy -- 17 decks high, most of them above the water -- when water collected on the side of boat with the 160-foot gash in it, it instantly tipped. When the ship went over, most of the lifeboats became useless. Power was lost, the boat filled with water, and these conditions would have made it extremely difficult for Schettino to stay on the bridge.

"At some point, he'd have to leave the bridge when they lost power," said Les Eadie, the captain of the training ship at Maine Maritime Academy in Castine, Maine.

"But you can't direct an evacuation from off the ship, unless fire and flames force you off," Eadie said, adding that Schettino could have directed his crew from the still-dry port side of the ship.

"When they were getting ready to evacuate, if you look closely at the photos, the only crew you see are the ones at the lifeboats -- the cooks and cleaners, who all have been trained for that," Eadie said. "You don't see any white hats of the officers. [Schettino] could have helped there."

Even following similar accidents, most large boats don't sink as fast as the Concordia did. When a cruise ship called the Sea Diamond hit a rock near the island of Santorini in Greece in 2007, it took a full day for the ship to sink. The Concordia was on its side just an hour after it collided with a rock. The only thing that was working in the boat's (and ultimately the captain's) favor was its proximity to the shore.

"It's the middle of the night. Things are happening quickly. But there is a huge amount of people to get to safety. There was no time to think," said Palmiotti, noting that emergency conditions make even the most practiced evacuation plans "probably not possible."

Without Schettino leading the operation, it took about seven hours for the 4,200 people on board to be brought safely to shore, significantly longer than the internationally mandated 30 minute time-frame. Nonetheless, most of the passengers made it off safely, even while the ship's captain was allegedly in a taxi cab driving away from the scene.

"There were an awful lot of people on board who did a lot of good work. Almost all of the 4,000 people got off safely, because the crew did their job. And they did it without direction from the top," said Palmiotti. "They stayed there in end with the passengers."

"The junior officers took it on themselves to start the evacuation," Eadie added.
There was also one captain who went by the books on Friday night in Giglio. While Schettino's action's likely caused a preventable disaster, the actions of Italian Coast Guard captain Gregorio de Falco, who ran the rescue mission from the shore, saved hundreds, if not thousands, of lives.

"Two men ... two stories, one who humiliates us, the other who redeems," the Italian daily Corriere della Sera said. "Thank you Captain de Falco, our country badly needs people like you."